



### **Chamber of Mines of South Africa**



# SUBMISSIONS TO THE PARLIAMENTARY SELECT COMMITTEE ON LAND AND MINERAL RESOURCES ON THE MINERAL AND PETROLEUM RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AMENDMENT BILL B15D-2013

### **Chamber of Mines - Who we are**



- Voluntary employer organisation that supports and promotes the SA mining industry provides strategic support and advisory input
- Advocacy and lobbying no executive authority over its member companies
- Members comprise:
  - 38 major mining companies
  - 32 junior mining companies
  - 4 associations Aggregates, Sands Producers Association of Southern Africa (ASPASA), South African Diamond Producers Organisation (SADPO), Association of Shaft Sinkers and SA Mining Contractors, Clay Brick Association of South Africa (CASA)
- · Chamber member companies:
  - represent more than 90% of SA's mineral production by value
  - contribute around R11.3 billion in taxes per annum
  - employ around 400,000 people directly

### **Contents**



- A. CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES
  - Introduction
  - "this Act" and Related Issues
  - Beneficiation and Related Issues
- **B. OTHER KEY ISSUES** 
  - Introduction
  - Other Key Issues
  - Chamber Request
- C. DEPARTMENT OF MINERAL RESOURCES TABLE OF OTHER PROPOSED AMENDMENTS
  - Introduction
  - Amendments in Table

### A. CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES



#### **□** INTRODUCTION

- PRESIDENTIAL RESERVATIONS
  - "this Act" (ss1 and 100(4), MPRDA)
  - Beneficiation (ss26(2B) and (3), MPRDA)
- NATIONAL ASSEMBLY DIFFERS
- CHAMBER SUPPORTS PRESIDENT



#### ☐ "this Act" AND RELATED ISSUES

BILL PROPOSALS

- s1, "this Act": to include Codes, Standards and Charter

s25(2)(fA): obligation to comply with Charter

s47(1)(f): suspension or cancellation on contravention of Charter and Standards

s100(3): Standards, Codes and Charter as conditions

s100(4): amendment and repeal of Standards, Codes and Charter



#### CHAMBER SUBMISSIONS

- Transformation of Codes, Standards and Charter into Parliamentary Legislation
- Offends against separation of powers between legislature and executive
  - Means Minister could amend or repeal Parliamentary legislation
    - Parliament cannot delegate its functions to make plenary legislation
  - Codes, Standards and Charter are not designed to be legislation
  - Punitive provisions in the MPRDA would apply without Parliament having control over the Codes, Standards and Charter

(Western Cape Legislature, 1995 and 2000; Akani)

#### CHAMBER REQUEST

Above clauses be deleted



#### **□** BENEFICIATION AND RELATED ISSUES

- BILL PROPOSALS
  - s1, "mine gate price": price at mine gate
  - s26(2B): producers obliged to offer prescribed percentage of production in prescribed quantities, qualities and timelines at mine gate price or agreed price
  - S26(3): no exports (other than by producers who have so offered) without Ministerial approval
- CHAMBER'S SUBMISSIONS
  - Producers suffer loss between export price (higher) and mine gate price (lower)
    - Expropriation of part of producer's income per s25(2), Constitution
      - Property (loss of income)
      - Acquisition (by the State)

(Agri)



- State will have to compensate for such expropriation per s25(3), Constitution and MPRDA Schedule II Item 12
- Claims for compensation under bilateral investment treaties
  - Broad definitions of "investment" and of "expropriation"
  - Survival of claims notwithstanding termination (Foresti)
- Deterrent to investment
- Unconstitutionality for inconsistency with RSA's international trade obligations
  - Restricts the quantity of minerals available for export
  - s233 of the Constitution recognises international law:
    - in interpretation of legislation
    - in determination of legality of subordinate legislation
  - ss7(2) and 39(1)(b) of the Constitution (State's obligation to give effect to the Bill of Rights) requires consideration and implementation of international law:
    - by the executive (the Minister) in tabling a Bill, and
    - by the legislature in enacting legislation

(Progress Office Machines; Glenister)



- Parliament in enacting ss26(2B) and (3) would violate SA's international law obligations (the only way in which the Minister could implement these provisions would violate such obligations)
- International agreements which would be contravened:
  - GATT, 1994
  - WTO Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
  - WTO Agreement on Trade Related Investment Measures
  - SA/EU Agreement on Trade, Development and Co-Operation, 1999
  - Southern African Development Community Trade Protocol, 1996
  - SA/EU Economic Partnership Agreement, 2016
  - Abovementioned Bilateral Investment Treaties (Fair and Equitable Treatment clauses)
- Related to the above: ss26(2B) and (3) will cause producers to breach their long-term contracts
- Therefore:
  - Ss26(2B) and (3) entail restrictions on quantities of exports



- Ss26(2B) and (3) breach SA's international trade law obligations
- SA's international law obligations are of constitutional relevance to:
  - Interpretation of legislation
  - · Exercise of subordinate powers
  - · Parliament's making of legislation

#### CHAMBER'S REQUEST

The above clauses be deleted from the Bill

### **B. OTHER KEY ISSUES**



#### **□** INTRODUCTION

CHAMBER SUPPORTS VARIOUS CLAUSES ON OTHER KEY ISSUES

#### □ <u>OTHER KEY ISSUES</u>

- INVITATIONS FOR APPLICATIONS (s9)
  - Dual system: Ministerial invitations, and retention of voluntary applications
  - Chamber requests reinstatement of s9(5) (preference)
- TRANSFERS OF PARTS OF RIGHTS (s11 (2A))
  - Facility for transfer of parts of rights coupled with applications for amendment (s102) and for new right (ss16 or 22)
- EXTENSION OF AREAS (s102 (2)(a))
  - Extension of not greater than the existing area
  - Such limitation not applicable to consolidations of existing adjacent rights
- ASSOCIATED MINERALS (ss102(2)(c), (3) and (4))
  - Facility for mining, declaration, and addition, of associated minerals

# B. OTHER KEY ISSUES (cont'd)



- ENVIRONMENTAL LEGISLATION (ss37, 38B and 43)
  - Accords with existing move to NEMA under Minister of Mineral Resources
  - Reflects transitional arrangements in NEMA
  - Residues also to be governed by NEMA not Waste Act
  - Case-by-case evaluation of post-closure financial provision (amount and period)
  - Chamber supports, but suggests further alignment of s38B with the transitional provisions in the National Environmental Management Laws Amendment Bill B14-2017
- HISTORIC RESIDUE STOCKPILES
  - Ownership for two years
  - Within mining area: holder must amend mining work programme
  - Outside mining area: owner has two years to apply for mining right or mining permit

#### ☐ CHAMBER REQUEST

 RETENTION AND ENACTMENT OF ABOVE CLAUSES AS AMENDED PER TABLE OF AMENDMENTS



#### **□** INTRODUCTION

- TABLE OF PROPOSED AMENDMENTS
- CHAMBER SUBMISSION ON SOME AMENDMENTS

#### ☐ <u>AMENDMENTS IN TABLE</u>

- o s1: "EFFECTIVE DATE"
  - Table proposal
    - Prescribed period for issue or execution of permit or right (Mawetse)
  - Chamber request
    - Commencement on issue or execution of permit or right



- Ss9(2) and (5): DUAL INVITATION/APPLICATION SYSTEM WITH PREFERENCE TO APPLICANT
  - Table Proposal
    - Retention of Voluntary Application System: Chamber supports
    - Delete s9(5) (preference)
  - Chamber request
    - Retain s9(5) (preference)



- o s17(2)(b): CONCENTRATION
  - Table Proposal
    - Delete: Chamber supports
  - Chamber Request
    - Delete both ss17(2)(b) and 33(c)
- s25(2)(fA): COMPLIANCE WITH CODES, STANDARDS AND CHARTER
  - Table Proposal
    - Insert reference to Standards
  - Chamber Request
    - Delete s25(2)(fA) for unconstitutionality: see A above



- s27(1)(c): MINING PERMITS
  - Table Proposal
    - Reserve mining permits for Black owned and controlled companies
  - Chamber Request
    - Delete since:
      - Chamber members, whether Black owned and controlled or not, need mining permits
      - The Mining Charter empowerment ownership target is 26% (or increased % in the Reviewed Mining Charter) which should remain applicable to mining permits
      - The proposal is unconstitutional in contravening:
        - the right to equality (s9, Constitution)
        - the right to freedom of trade, occupation and profession (s22, Constitution)
        - Parliamentary procedure (s76, Constitution and the Joint Rules of Parliament)



- S47(1)(f): CONTRAVENTION OF CODES, STANDARDS AND CHARTER
  - Table Proposal
    - Suspension or cancellation on contravention of Codes, Standards and Charter
  - Chamber Request
    - Delete s47(1)(f) for:
      - Unconstitutionality: see A above
      - Unconstitutional Parliamentary procedure (s76, Constitution, and the Joint Rules of Parliament)
- S80(2A): EXPLORATION RIGHTS
  - Table Proposal
    - Applicants to comply with Mining Charter
  - Chamber Request
    - Replace with reference to Petroleum Charter



## **THANK YOU**